

GOOD PRACTICES

TO COUNTER VIOLENCE AGAINST
WOMEN AND GIRLS, INCLUDING
ACID AND BURN VIOLENCE, AND
PROMOTE GENDER EQUALITY IN
PAKISTAN

By
Valerie Khan
Gender & Child Protection Expert



Consultant:

Valerie Khan
Gender & Child Protection Expert

Khadija Ali
LL.B (Hons) (London)
LL.M (International Development Law) (Warwick, UK)

This report is published by Acid Survivors Foundation Pakistan (ASF Pakistan) in collaboration with the National Commission on the Status of Women (NCSW) and Group Development Pakistan, with support of the European Union (EU).

EU Disclaimer:

The contents of this publication are the sole responsibility of Acid Survivors Foundation Pakistan and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the European Union.

ACRONYMS

AASHA	Alliance Against Sexual Harassment	NCSW	National Commission on the Status of Women
ASFP	Acid Survivors Foundation Pakistan	NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
BBC	BISP Beneficiaries Committee	NCRC	National Commission on the Rights of the Child
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women	NCHR	National Commission For Human Rights Pakistan
CNIC	Computerised National Identity Card	NIWC	National Implementation Watch Committee
CRC	Child Rights Convention	PAHWA	Protection Against Harassment of Women at the Workplace
CSO	Civil Society Organisation	PCSW	Provincial Commission on the Status of Women
EU	European Union	PC1	Planning Commission form 1
FOSPAH	Federal Ombudsman Secretariat for Protection Against Harassment	P&D	Planning & Development Department
GBV	Gender-Based Violence	PEMRA	Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority
GDP	Group Development Pakistan	PMT	Proxy Means Test
GMIS	Gender Management Information System	PGPR	Punjab Gender Parity Report
GoPB	Government of Punjab	PSC	Poverty Score Card
GSP+	Generalised System of Preferences Plus	PSC	Provincial Steering Committee
HRCYTF	Human Rights Child and Youth Task Force	KPCSW	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Commission on the Status of Women
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil & Political Rights	KPK	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social & Cultural Rights	SAIEVAC	South Asian Initiative to Eradicate Violence Against Children
ICT	Islamabad Capital Territory	SPCSW	Sindh Provincial Commission on the Status of Women
INGO	International Non-Governmental Organisation	SHRC	Sindh Human Rights Commission
ILO	International Labour Organisation	SCPA	Sindh Child Protection Authority
LEA	Law Enforcement Agencies	SOP	Standard Operating Procedures
MIS	Management Information System	SWD	Social Welfare Department
MNA	Member National Assembly	VAWG	Violence Against Women and Girls
MoHR	Ministry of Human Rights	WDD	Women Development Department
MPA	Member Provincial Assembly	UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
NACG	National Action Coordination Group	UNICEF	United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund
NCHR	National Commission on Human Rights		

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1	Foreword	01
2	Message From Acid Survivors Foundation Pakistan	02
3	Background	03
4	Laws and Institutions to Counter VAWG in Pakistan	07
5	Secondary Data Findings	10
6	Mapping of Good Pakistani Practices to counter GBV & VAWG in particular, identified via primary data	15
7	Conclusion	39

FOREWORD

Pakistan over the past three or so decades has witnessed a growing public discourse on violence against women and girls and a realisation that in large measure violence is based on gender biases embedded in social structures and unequal power relations. This discourse involving women's rights activists, legislators, implementers, survivors of violence and citizens at large has led to the enactment of laws, establishment of institutions, and introduction of initiatives by the government and civil society organisations to address the problem of violence against women and girls.

Documenting the initiatives, tracking implementation of laws and policies and assessing their impact, however, pose a challenge. In the absence of a baseline regarding prevalence, extent and nature of VAW, the National Commission on the Status of Women (NCSW) has adopted multiple strategies to measure impact and track progress. The Commission's objectives are to safeguard and promote women's rights in the country and achieve gender equality before the law in accordance with the Constitution and Pakistan's international commitments. Its broad mandate includes reviewing and analysing laws and policies and making recommendations to relevant departments/agencies. It employs various strategies (benchmarking, research, development of indices, court cases) for purposes of analysis and review. The Commission has entered into a partnership with Acid Survivors Foundation Pakistan, a credible organization with a track record of documenting acid and burn cases across the country and their follow up.

This report is a joint endeavour between NCSW and ASFP to map interventions that represent 'good practice' in countering violence against women including acid and burn violence. The publication offers framework/criteria of good practice as well as showcases some successful interventions using the criteria. It brings together useful information for both government as well as civil society organisations.

I see this joint effort as a significant marker in NCSW and ASFP's collaboration which I hope will continue to document the process of laws and institutional mechanisms and identify areas where work still has to be done, to ensure commitment towards elimination of VAWG and GBV in Pakistan.

Khawar Mumtaz

Chairperson NCSW

MESSAGE FROM ACID SURVIVORS FOUNDATION PAKISTAN

This mapping exercise relating to good practices to counter VAWG in Pakistan is an integrated part of a two-year intervention executed by Acid Survivors Foundation Pakistan in partnership with Group Development Pakistan and in collaboration with the National Commission on the Status of Women and Benazir Income Support Programme, with financial support from the European Union through its European Instrument for Democracy and Human Rights.

The project is titled “TAAWUN” (SYNERGIES); it aims to support gender equality and contribute to supporting women’s rights in Pakistan in order to **a)** Contribute to preventing Violence Against Women and Girls and **b)** Support women's rights and fight against acid and burn violence.

To this effect, the project expects to achieve the following results:

- Increased basis of evidence for law/policy makers, human rights bodies and civil society through reports/research relating to VAWG (including acid and burn violence), gender equality and women’s rights.
- Improved collaboration between public and private actors to support women’s rights and respond to VAWG (including acid and burn violence)
- Enhanced awareness and engagement of law/policy makers, children and youth and community members to prevent VAWG
- Increased capacity of Law Enforcement Agencies, service providers and community members to respond to VAWG (including acid and burn violence)

We invite you to join us to make a difference!

F. Mohammad Khan

Executive Director

Acid Survivors Foundation Pakistan

BACKGROUND

Following resuscitation of the democratic process in 2008, the Federal Legislature undertook a number of positive steps including promulgation of laws to improve women and girls' rights and avenues to redress grievances against abuse and discrimination. Two laws were enacted in 2010 to criminalize sexual harassment and establish related codes of conduct and mechanisms for such complaints in the work place. In 2011, the Criminal Law (Second Amendment) Act 2011 defined acid and burn crimes and also stipulated harsher punishments for such offences whereas, during the same year, the Anti-Women Customary Practices Act criminalised customary practices that constituted violence against women and girls. The National Commission on the Status of Women Act 2012 established an autonomous commission to monitor violations of women rights and granted considerable powers to the Commission to investigate such violations. Pursuant to these, many other laws have been promulgated at federal and provincial levels to address the women and girls' rights situation in Pakistan like the establishment of National Commission on Human Rights, a child marriage restraint law in Sindh along with establishment of statutory bodies like Sindh Commission on Human Rights, Sindh Commission on the Status of Woman and Sindh Child Protection Authority; domestic violence laws in Punjab, Sindh and Balochistan; establishment of Punjab Commission on the Status of Women

and KP Commission on the Status of Women in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, etc.

Within this domestic context, the international commitments of Pakistan pertaining to human rights also have an important role to play. The Concluding Observations of the Committee for the Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women call upon Pakistan to:

“Adopt without delay pending bills, such as the Domestic Violence Bill and the Prevention and Control of Women Trafficking Bill; and design strategies to overcome obstacles to their adoption, including through the sensitization of parliamentarians and members of the Council of Islamic Ideology on women’s rights.”¹

While the CEDAW Committee has also appreciated the fact that Pakistan has promulgated various pro-women and girls laws over the years to counter VAWG, it has stressed for more to be done by the government in this regard. Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child have appreciated the legislative intervention by Sindh to raise the age of girl from 16 to 18 years, however, the Observations reiterate Pakistan’s obligation to harmonise domestic law with international commitments in the following words:

“The Committee reiterates its previous recommendation that the State party ensures the full harmonization of its legislation as

¹ Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, *Concluding observations on the fourth periodic report of Pakistan, adopted by the Committee at its*

fifty-fourth session (11 February–1 March 2013) (United Nations 27 March 2013) 4

regards the definition of the child so as to define a child as any human being below the age of 18 years.²

The Human Rights Committee, formed under the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights to monitor the Covenant's enforcement, has appreciated the important laws for women enacted by the Pakistani state in 2016, it has still recommended the following for Pakistan to ensure:

“Expedite the adoption of laws relating to violence against women that are under consideration at the federal and provincial levels and ensure they comply with international human rights standards; (b) effectively enforce anti-honour killings laws, anti-rape law and other relevant laws criminalizing violence against women and domestic violence, and monitor their enforcement throughout the territory.³”

While the Constitution of Pakistan delineates equal rights for men and women in Pakistan,⁴ it is important to take note of gender power differentials in society to translate equality through effective policy and legislation. As various pro-women and girl laws have been passed since 2010, the emerging case law provides a picture of judicial interpretations on substantive rights afforded to women and girls. For example, the Criminal Amendment (Women Protection) Act 2006 criminalises sexual intercourse with a girl under the age of sixteen as statutory rape, however, the provision has been interpreted by the courts to not constitute a crime where a nikkah has been

contracted with the girl, even if she is below the age of sixteen.⁵ Progressive and positive developments in case law are also important to note. In one instance, the accused in an acid and burn crime case requested the case be transferred to an ordinary court as the act was committed in a private place rather than a public space and did not instil any fear in the society at large therefore not constituting an act of terrorism. The application of the accused was rejected by the Lahore High Court stating that the criminal act of throwing acid constituted an act of terrorism itself and fell within the jurisdiction of anti-terrorism court.⁶ The shift in governance landscape also poses a unique set of challenges for countering gender based violence and VAWG in particular. Understanding of the 18th constitutional amendment and division of legislative powers is another important feature. An understanding of the federal and provincial division of legislative powers is important to document good practices within their current contexts. Therefore, the mapping exercise for this report has conducted research and data collection for Islamabad Capital Territory, Punjab, Sindh and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa in consonance with the powers divided in the Constitution. The legislative interventions which could be termed as ‘good practices’ need to be analysed against an understanding of the laws applicability and jurisdiction. For example: even though the focus over the years has been on substantive laws for countering VAWG, recent laws like the Criminal Law (Anti -

² Committee on the Rights of the Child, *Concluding Observations on the fifth Periodic Report of Pakistan* (United Nations 11th July 2016) 4

the Initial Report of Pakistan (United Nations July

⁴ Constitution of Pakistan 1973, Art 25

⁵ 2013 PLD 243 Lahore High Court

⁶ PLD 2016 Lahore 89

Rape) Amendment 2016 are responding to the oft-repeated criticism by human rights lawyers and jurists that laws for women should not only target substantive rights but also take into account the procedural legal impediments women face in accessing their rights. The Anti-Rape Amendment in this regard is a good practice as it focuses on amending the procedural law for rape survivors in accessing justice by increasing liability on police, investigating officer and medico-legal officer to ensure that the relevant evidence for the rape survivor's trial is gathered.⁷

The Beijing Platform for Action, adopted at the Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing in 1995, calls on Governments to:

"Take measures to ensure the protection of women subjected to violence, access to just and effective remedies, including compensation and indemnification and healing of victims, and rehabilitation of perpetrators."⁸

Therefore, provision of support systems to prevent violence against women as well as provide coordinated rehabilitative and reintegration measures and structures are important caveats for a system that is gender responsive. In this regard, the Council of Europe's Istanbul Convention, which is a regional treaty, provides a comprehensive framework of necessary support mechanisms and standards to counter violence against women. The Istanbul Convention focuses on

specialist support services to counter VAWG and support survivors of VAWG. Specialist support services are defined in the Convention as:

"...have specialised in providing support and assistance tailored to the... needs of victims of specific forms of violence against women or domestic violence and are not open to the general public"⁹

Furthermore, the explanation clarifies that:

"while [specialist support services] may be services run or funded by government authorities, the large majority of specialist services are offered by NGOs".¹⁰

The Istanbul Convention, therefore, provides a comprehensive elaboration of standards and guidelines with regards to support mechanisms to counter VAWG. To respond to the specific needs of women victims of gender-based violence, the Istanbul Convention highlights the need for different services and institutions to counter VAWG: Setting up of shelters, telephone helplines, and rape crisis centres or sexual violence referral centres;¹¹

- Measures be taken to support victims of gender-based violence through the legal process;¹²
- Victims be provided with appropriate support services so that their rights and interests are duly presented and taken into account.¹³

The federal and provincial governments, civil society organisations, INGOs and UN Agencies

⁷ Shazia Shaheen and Khadija Ali, *The Justice Prelude: A Socio-Legal Perspective on Women's Access to Justice* (Strengthening Participatory Organisation (SPO) 2017) 22

⁸ *Report of the Fourth World Conference on Women* Beijing, China, 4-15 September 1995 (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.96.IV.13), para. 124.

⁹ Istanbul Convention, Article 22 (Paragraph 125 of the Explanatory Report)

¹⁰ Ibid

¹¹ Istanbul Convention, Article 23

¹² Istanbul Convention, Article 55

¹³ Istanbul Convention, Article 56

in Pakistan have over the last few years devoted some resources to addressing and countering VAWG. While the impact of such efforts can be observed in the form of enhanced legal rights of women and girls in the country, it is necessary to document the processes that led to such results. Service delivery to counter VAWG has also increased over the years in light of new legislation and administrative actions to empower marginalised groups such as women and girl survivors of GBV.

Against this backdrop, the mapping exercise seeks to analyse the initiatives propounded by both government and civil society in order to identify and accumulate the 'good practices' that have yielded positive impact in Pakistan. The mapped good practices can serve as an advocacy tool for further legal/policy reform, programming and overall strategy to stop VAWG and promote gender equality,

democracy and peace. The framework for this mapping exercise therefore includes a thorough literature review that has informed and framed the data collection tools for this mapping exercise. The preliminary findings below therefore highlight the information gleaned from the secondary data; the information gaps in the secondary data; and the resulting methodology to complete this mapping exercise.

It is pertinent to mention that since VAWG is still rampant in Pakistan and Asia and highly prevalent in the world, this report only intends to disseminate examples of good practices from Pakistan to prevent and better respond to VAWG. In no way can we consider that since those good practices exist, the issue of VAWG is solved in our country. Clearly, much more work is required, but there is hope, and we must hold on to it and capitalise upon those encouraging results.

LAWS AND INSTITUTIONS TO COUNTER VAWG IN PAKISTAN

The mapping exercise has been conducted against the backdrop of the following matrix of women and girl specific laws, institutions and services to counter violence against women and girls.

No.	National/Provincial	Legislative Interventions
1	National	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Criminal Amendment (Women Protection) Act 2006 • Section 509 Pakistan Penal Code Criminal Amendment 2010 • Protection Against Harassment of Women at Work Place Act 2010 • National Commission on the Status of Women Act 2012 (amended by the 2018 Act) • Anti-Women Practices Criminal Amendment 2012 • Acid and Burn Crime Amendment 2012 • Women in Distress Law 2011; Women in Distress and Detention Fund (Amendment) 2018 • Anti-Honour Killing Criminal Amendment 2016 • Anti-Rape Law Criminal Amendment Act 2016 • The Criminal Law Amendment Act 2016 (Criminalising Violence against Children) • Juvenile Justice Systems Act 2018 • Transgender Persons (Protection of Rights) Act 2018
2	Islamabad Capital Territory	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Islamabad Capital Territory Child Protection Act 2018
3	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Commission on the Status of Women Act 2009 • Child Protection and Welfare Act 2010 • Prohibition of Child Labour Act 2015
4	Punjab	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Punjab Protection Against Harassment of Women at the Workplace (Amendment) Act 2012 • Punjab Muslim Family Laws (Amendment) Act 2015 • Punjab Protection of Women Against Violence Act 2016 • Punjab Destitute and Neglected Children Act 2004 • Punjab Marriage Restraint (Amendment) Act 2015 • Punjab Prohibition of Child Labour at Brick Kilns Act 2016 • Punjab Restriction on Employment of Children Act 2016
5	Sindh	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sindh Domestic Violence (Prevention and Protection) Act, 2013

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sindh Children Act 1955 • Sindh Child Marriage Restraint Act, 2013
6	Balochistan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Balochistan Domestic Violence (Protection and Prevention) Act 2014 • Balochistan Protection Against Harassment of Women at Work Place Act 2016 • Balochistan Child Protection Act 2016

No.	National/Provincial	Human Rights Institutions	Service Delivery
1	National	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ministry of Human Rights • National Commission on the Status of Women • National Commission on Human Rights 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1099 MoHR Helpline • Shaheed Benazir Bhutto Human Rights Centre for Women
2	Punjab	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Punjab Human Rights and Minorities Affairs Department • Punjab Women Development Department • Punjab Commission on the Status of Women • Punjab Child Protection Bureau 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Transitional Housing for Women (PCSW) • Women's Economic Incubator (PCSW) • Punjab Women's Toll-Free Helpline 2043
3	Sindh	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sindh Law, Parliamentary Affairs and Human Rights Department • Sindh Women Development Department • Sindh Child Protection Authority • Sindh Commission on Human Rights • Sindh Commission on the Status of Women 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dar-ul-aman (Karachi): PANAH • Sindh Human Rights Department Helpline 0800-58888
4	Balochistan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Balochistan Social Welfare, Special Education, Literacy/Non-Formal Education and Human Rights Department • Balochistan Women Development Department • Balochistan Child Protection Commission (to be constituted under the 2016 Act) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dar-ul-aman (Quetta)
5	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • KP Commission on the Status of Women 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dar-ul-aman (Peshawar)

		<ul style="list-style-type: none">• KP Directorate on Human Rights• KP Child Protection and Welfare Commission	
--	--	---	--

SECONDARY DATA FINDINGS

DEFINING 'GOOD PRACTICE'

An initial distinction between the terms 'best practice' and 'good practice' has been important for the brevity of this mapping exercise. 'Best practice' usually denotes a higher threshold as it suggests a strong claim that the practice works in all locations and for all individuals.¹⁴ However, the terminology of 'best practice' has seen reduction over the last decade as the term encapsulates rigidity and fails to espouse the various vulnerabilities and disadvantages which groups suffer from, for example – women with disabilities.¹⁵ Therefore, the preferred terms for the mapping exercise include 'good practice' and 'promising practice'. However, the major distinction between a 'good' or 'promising' practice hinges on whether the practice has been applied over a period of time or not, to yield positive impact. If yes, then it is a 'good practice'. If not, then the practice is a promising one where the impact of the practice upon conclusion over a certain period of time would determine whether or not it is a 'good practice'.

Furthermore, academics and practitioners struggle with defining the criteria for 'good practice' as various criteria exist to define the same. This has been a major finding of this literature review. Some of the salient definitions found in the existing body of literature have been reproduced for further discussion. According to a report titled: 'Study for the exchange of good practices and legal instruments in the fight against gender-based

violence between Norway, Iceland and Spain' supported by EEA grant, the term 'good practice' has various connotations:

"The concept of 'good practice' refers to the identification of models of efficiency in the management of public resources, through the analysis and evaluation of applied experiences with the goal of progress or improvement. Defining, conceptualizing and systematizing good practices particularly in the context of gender violence policies remains as one of the main challenges in States' common agenda. To determine whether a practice is 'good', 'promising' or 'effective' depends both on the standards that are used in evaluation and on the local context" (United Nations, 2006:101).¹⁶

According to an evaluation by UNICEF:

"Good practices are well documented and assessed programming practices that provide evidence of success/impact and which are valuable for replication, scaling up and further study."¹⁷

UNESCO proposes the following definition:

"Best Practices are model projects or policies that have the following four common characteristics: are innovative, make a difference, they have a sustainable effect and have the potential for replication, serving as a model for generating initiatives elsewhere."¹⁸

The European Institute of Gender Equality proposes the following:

Documentacion/otros Informes/DOC/Segundo_borrador_preliminar_(english).pdf

¹⁷

http://www.unicef.org/evaluation/index_49082.htm

¹⁸ <http://www.unesco.org/most/bphome.htm#1>

¹⁴ <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/egm/vaw-gp-2005/docs/FINALREPORTgoodpractices.pdf>

¹⁵ Ibid

¹⁶

<https://www.msssi.gob.es/en/ssi/violenciaGenero/>

"Good practices in gender mainstreaming is any experience/initiative displaying techniques, methods or approaches which function in a way that produce effects and results coherent with the definition of gender mainstreaming, which are considered to be effective in delivering gender mainstreaming as a transformative strategy, and therefore, deserving to be disseminated and proposed to other organizational contexts."¹⁹

A report of an expert group meeting held by the United Nations Division for the Advancement of Women titled: "Good practices in combating and eliminating violence against women," summates the common principles of good practice in the following points:

1. **"Capacity Building:** A key element in the development of good practice is the extent to which States enable their employees and others in a position to assist victims of violence - be they judges, prosecutors, police officers, border guards, health practitioners or teachers – to build their capacity and skill to understand and respond to all forms of violence against women and girls. Specialized training and continuous learning are vital.
2. **Expansion of Opportunities for CSOs:** A further element indicative of good practice is the measures taken to expand opportunities for members of civil society to take action defending women and girls rights and assert their commitment to a world in which women and girls are free and safe from all forms of violence and discrimination against women and girls.

3. **Need-Based and Safe:** Practices cannot be considered good/promising if they fail to look after the needs of those who receive /provide services, and/or neglect to protect human rights defenders.
4. **Upholding Women and Girls Agency:** Since control of women and girls' sexuality underpins many forms of violence against women and girls, an essential aspect of work to end violence against women and girls is to establish the principle of women's sexual autonomy and ensure that legal systems uphold it.
5. **Internal Practices of INGOs and CSOs:** At the national and international levels, it is vital that institutions which take a lead in setting standards of policy and practice themselves adhere to these standards: for example, protection and promotion of women's human rights, especially protection from violence, should be an explicit component of all work undertaken in the name of the United Nations.²⁰

The list of factors assessing whether a practice is "good" is not exhaustive and can be tailored to the specific study in question. The 'Study for the exchange of good practices and legal instruments in the fight against gender-based violence between Norway, Iceland and Spain' supported by EEA grant report listed out the following twenty factors to assess whether a practice is a good practice or not, these twenty factors were part of the questionnaire that assessed and determined good practices in countering Gender Based Violence:

¹⁹ EIGE European Institute of Gender Equality, "Mainstreaming gender into the policies and programmes of the institutions of the European Union and EU Member States", Publications Office of the

European Union, Luxembourg, 2013.

²⁰ <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/cgm/vaw-gp-2005/docs/FINALREPORTgoodpractices.pdf>, pg. 8 -9

1	IMPACT	11	EFFICIENCY
2	INNOVATION	12	WOMEN'S PARTICIPATION
3	INTERNAL COHERENCE	13	POLITICAL AND TECHNICAL SUSTAINABILITY
4	TRANSFERABILITY	14	TRAINING AND CAPACITY BUILDING
5	CHANGES IN LEGAL FRAMEWORK	15	COMPREHENSIVE RESPONSE
6	ECONOMIC VIABILITY	16	WOMEN'S SAFETY
7	INSTITUTIONAL CHANGES	17	NETWORKING
8	ALLIANCES AND COORDINATION MECHANISMS	18	WOMEN-CENTERED APPROACH
9	EVALUABLE	19	GENDER PERSPECTIVE
10	EFFECTIVITY	20	EQUALITY AND DIVERSITY

In stark contrast to the twenty factors listed above, the UN Joint Programme on Gender Based Violence in Uganda formulated the following criteria to assess good practices:

1. **Relevance:** Relevance to United Nations Development Assistance Framework programming and operational/management areas
2. **Innovation:** New and creative approaches or ideas to solving problems
3. **Impact:** Demonstrate a positive and tangible result that enhances or enriches programme delivery and that contribute (or at least is expected to contribute) to long term results

4. **Replicability:** Serve as effective models; have potential for application to other contexts/programmes.²¹

Similar concrete criteria have been used to define good practice in a previous research of Acid Survivors Foundation Pakistan regarding a study on the implementation acid and burn crimes law: 1. Relevance, 2. Effectiveness, 3. Efficiency and 4. Sustainability.²²

Furthermore, in a research conducted by Group Development Pakistan regarding an intervention to counter child labour in one slum of Lahore, the following criteria were adopted to define good practice:

1. Self-fulfilling, 2. Positive change, 3. Sustainability and 4. Replicability.

In view of the literature review and various frameworks available to define good practices, it is important to propose criteria for good practice that takes into account both the procedure as well as substantive outcome(s) of the practice in question. In order to achieve this, the following criteria have been stipulated for the current report to map good practices to counter VAWG in Pakistan :

1. **Self-fulfilling:** The criterion of self-fulfilling has been incorporated to record the effect of the 'process' of the practice on the beneficiaries or specific audience. This instils a criterion that not only focuses on the substantive outcomes but also on the processes involved. It is also beneficiary/stakeholder-centered and includes a psycho-social dimension that, according to us, guarantees the human aspect of the documented practices.
2. **Innovation:** The criterion of innovation involves asking how the practice is a pilot

²¹

<http://uganda.unfpa.org/sites/default/files/submissions/ToR%20for%20synthesised%20good%20practice%20documentation%20Final.pdf>

²² Acid Violence: Fostering Effective Implementation of Pro-Women and Girls' Laws, ASF (2014)

or an improvement to existing practices or basis of knowledge. What new approach or methodology has been introduced through the practice?

3. **Impact:** The criterion of impact seeks to identify the medium term or long term change/positive difference triggered by the practice, by demonstrating a positive and tangible result that enhances or enriches existing programs to counter GBV and VAWG in particular.
4. **Sustainability:** The criterion of sustainability focuses on the resources procured or developed to sustain the practice on a long term basis.
5. **Replicability:** The criterion of replicability seeks to identify whether the practice is transferrable and whether it can be up-scaled or replicated to other programs.
6. **Gender Perspective:** The criterion of gender perspective seeks to assess whether the practice is grounded on a strong basis of gender analysis; comprehensive, clear and appropriate definitions of gender based violence, whether it holds men/boys accountable for the use of violence and relies on the idea that GBV is a violation of human rights

and the result of structural inequalities rooted in the imbalance of power between men and women (mostly), boys and girls.

7. **Child Sensitivity and Participation:** The criterion of child sensitivity will seek to assess whether the practice is child sensitive in nature; responsive to the power differentials children suffer in relation to adults; whether it encourages the safe, meaningful and inclusive participation of children and provides a conducive environment for children to seek services or participate. The practice should also minimise any impact or harm to children and consider the best interest of the child as a priority at every stage.

After a thorough perusal of literature on the subject, the six part criteria above has been used to identify good practices to counter violence against women and girls where the stakeholders included CSOs, government as well as INGOs. The criteria was incorporated in the Key Informant Guide²³ to gather primary data on the subject. The primary data gathered was then organised into thematic areas for furnishing a comprehensive report on the subject.

'GOOD PRACTICES' OF CIVIL SOCIETY ORGANISATIONS AND GOVERNMENT IN PAKISTAN IDENTIFIED THROUGH SECONDARY DATA

A perusal of secondary data sources has revealed that documentation of 'good practices' or 'best practices' or 'promising practices' to counter violence against women and girls in Pakistan has been virtually absent. It is important to iterate that many evaluations of organisations documented 'lessons learnt' or 'success stories' from their interventions;

however, an exercise of mapping concrete and specific good practices for replication to counter violence against women and girls is a necessity. While the lessons learnt and evaluations of various organisations have facilitated the identification of key informant interviewees, a reader-friendly and concrete document paving a road map of good practices

²³ The Key Informant Guide is an ASFP internal document that has been used for this mapping, available on demand

would facilitate future informed interventions that can be effective.

Important features of the literature pertaining to mapped good practices to counter VAWG in Pakistan included the following:

- Shirkat Gah's "Keeping Adrift: Documenting Best Practices for Addressing Gender Based Violence from the Platform of Women Friendly Spaces" highlighted success stories and strategies to counter VAWG from the platform of Women Friendly Spaces created in a humanitarian setting. The study's format is more in line with highlighting challenges and achievements rather than extrapolating 'good practices' but it aids in drawing important differentiations when defining 'good practices' as opposed to lessons learnt.
- ASF's success stories highlighted the various practices employed in aiding survivors of acid and burn violence. Of particular importance is the 2014 study which documents the implementation of acid and burn crime bill as an example of good practice in light of the outcomes achieved by the intervention. ASF's research also contributed in the development of the framework above to define 'good practice' for this study. Data collected by ASF regarding acid violence also reveals various avenues where primary data can be collected to map good practices further.
- Solidar/ Labour Education Foundation /Group Development Pakistan's 2017 study to counter child labour in a slum of Lahore is another study which has contributed to the development of the framework for mapping good practices above. Other resources available on GD Pakistan's website highlight the need for further primary data collection to map good

practices related to child rights and child participation.

- The AASHA Experience is a documentation of the lobbying and advocacy process for the anti-sexual harassment laws in Pakistan. The report highlights the strategic decisions taken by the alliance for lobbying and implementation of laws. While the 'good practices' are not spelt out or collated, the concluding chapter serves as a background to primary data collection from Mehergarh with regards to implementation of anti-sexual harassment laws.
- BISP or Benazir Income Support Program's success is another important feature of this literature review which requires further data collection and documentation. Major achievements of BISP have included increase from 0.7 million to 1.3 million children (48% girls) who were supported to attend primary school; expansion of education program from 5 to 32 districts and Biometric Verification System for payments to beneficiaries in 5 districts.²⁶ As a government functionary the achievements of BISP have been lauded by international and national organisations and therefore necessitate a systematic mapping of the good practices being employed by them to attain their goals. Further interventions that have been mapped through primary data collection would include but would not be limited to the Gender Management Information System set up by the Punjab Commission on the Status of Women, its resulting gender parity report and the mechanism adopted by BISP in identifying beneficiaries. The secondary data findings have therefore highlighted the gaps that have been filled by primary data collection: those are described in the next chapter.

²⁶ DFID's evaluation of BISP 2016

MAPPING OF GOOD PAKISTANI PRACTICES TO COUNTER GBV & VAWG IN PARTICULAR, IDENTIFIED VIA PRIMARY DATA

EUROPEAN UNION DELEGATION TO PAKISTAN - INTERTWINING WOMEN AND CHILD RIGHT WITH PAKISTAN'S ECONOMICS AND COMMERCE

International trade offers immense opportunities to utilize linkages of the export oriented industries for inclusive development. Since January 2014, Pakistan has been a beneficiary of the European Union's Generalised Scheme of Preferences (GSP+). The GSP+ is subject to certain conditions: ratification and compliance of 27 international conventions on human and labour rights, good governance and environment protection.²⁵

The EU GSP+ has provided the necessary impetus for human rights legislation, policies and action plans at federal and provincial tiers to uphold the implementation of 27 international conventions. EU's GSP assessment of Pakistan encourages the positive steps Pakistan has taken to address human rights challenges for competitive edge in European markets.²⁶ Pakistan has made strides in its efforts to infuse a human rights

based approach to development especially since the EU has been sending GSP+ monitoring delegations intersecting with a peace and collaboration focused bilateral dialogue. The European Commission's report assessing the implementation of EU GSP+ conditions by Pakistan stated: 'During the reporting period 2016-2017, improvements have been noted on the institutional side... and increasingly active and effective independent oversight bodies.'²⁷ While various achievements in countering VAWG have been ensured, concerted efforts between provincial and federal governments are still needed to ensure implementation of the SDG framework in Pakistan".

A key informant interview was conducted with Ingeborg Zonge of the European Union Delegation to Pakistan; during the discussion, the following good practice was identified:

²⁵ Ministry of Commerce. GSP Plus Ministry of Commerce. <http://gspplus.gov.pk>. [Online] [Cited: February 16, 2018.] <http://gspplus.gov.pk/themes/>.

²⁶ European Commission. The EU Special Incentive Arrangement for Sustainable Development. <http://trade.ec.europa.eu>. [Online] January 2018. [Cited: February 16, 2018.]

http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/docs/2018/january/tradoc_156544.pdf.

²⁷ European Commission. The EU Special Incentive Arrangement for Sustainable Development. <http://trade.ec.europa.eu>. [Online] January 2018. [Cited: February 16, 2018.] http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/docs/2018/january/tradoc_156544.pdf.

Practice: Intertwining rights of women and children with Pakistan's trade and commerce

Process: As part of the European Union Generalised Scheme of Preference Status given to Pakistan, the European Union requires Pakistan to implement 27 international conventions ratified by Pakistan which are clustered into the following groups: Human Rights, Labour Rights, Environment, Narcotics Control and Corruption. The cluster on human rights includes major international conventions pertaining to women and girls: International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Convention on the Rights of the Child and Convention on Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women.

No.	Criteria	Practice
1	Self-Fulfilling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Government of Pakistan sensitized to implement international commitments pertaining to women and child rights and motivated to project its achievements at regional and international levels EU parliamentarians motivated to support Pakistan when results are placed before them regarding promotion of women and girls' rights
2	Innovation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Countering violence against women and girls linked with Pakistan's trade and commerce Tying up trade incentives and profits to women and girls' rights
3	Impact	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Various interventions regarding women and child rights implemented by the Government of Pakistan after EU GSP+ Improved legal and policy framework for women and girls World/regional models available for replication to promote women and girls' rights
4	Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Legislative and institutional developments pertaining to women and child rights owned and funded by the Government of Pakistan
5	Replicability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The progress of Pakistan documented in reports published by state functionaries as well as European Union This system can apply to other countries
6	Gender Perspective	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Inclusion of international conventions pertaining to women and children infuses a gender perspective in implementation of initiatives to counter VAWG
7	Child Sensitivity and Participation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The inclusion of UN CRC in the list of convention promotes child sensitivity and participation amongst state functionaries

NATIONAL COMMISSION ON THE STATUS OF WOMEN: PUBLIC-PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP TO CONDUCT EVIDENCE-BASED INTERVENTIONS TO COUNTER ACID & BURN VIOLENCE IN PAKISTAN.

The National Commission on the Status of Women (NCSW)²⁸ is a statutory body, established in July 2000. It was made administratively and financially independent and autonomous by the NCSW Act 2012. It is an outcome of the national and international commitments of the Government of Pakistan like Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, 1995, and National Plan of Action (NPA) for Women, 1998. Five Commissions have completed their respective term of three years. Term of the last Commission expired on 31st December, 2015. The current sixth Commission's term is due to end on 31 October 2019. The National Commission on the Status of Women (NCSW) was established with the specific purpose to: Examine policies, programs and other measures taken by the Government for women's development and gender equality; Review laws, rules and regulations affecting the status of women; Monitor mechanisms and institutional procedures for redress of violations of women's rights and individual grievances; Encourage and sponsor research to generate information, analysis and studies relating to women and gender issues; Develop and maintain interaction and dialogue with NGOs, experts and individuals in society at the national, regional and international level; any

other function assigned to it by the Federal Government.

In 2013, the NCSW signed an MOU with ASFP and then in 2017, it signed a letter of collaboration to renew its fruitful cooperation. The partnership and the strong evidence based advocacy and awareness actions that it entailed resulted in a decrease of more than 50% in acid violence in Pakistan, since 2014, a world record in the last 10 years, with regard to VAWG. The partnership also helped in the tabling of laws and announcement of policies and is still critical for the current drafting of comprehensive legislation to eradicate acid and burn violence and respond to it as per constitutional obligations and international standards.

During a Key Informant Interview with Mrs. Khawar Mumtaz, Chairperson, NCSW, this public-private partnership to conduct evidenced-based interventions to counter acid & burn violence in Pakistan, was actually identified as an example of good practice with a strong focus on ASFP MIS that allows informed strategies, actions and guarantees technical credibility. ASFP and NCSW designed interventions that rely on the MIS analysis and which has resulted in historical outcomes.

²⁸ <http://www.ncsw.gov.pk/>

Practice: using MIS to conduct evidenced-based interventions to counter acid & burn violence in Pakistan through a public private partnership

No.	Criteria	Practice
1	Self-Fulfilling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> NCSW & ASFP believe they are part of an efficient action to reduce VAWG in Pakistan State actors & CSOs motivated to support and be part of a positive societal change that can be demonstrated Improved self-confidence of pro women & girl rights activists who can rely on credible data to propose interventions to counter acid & burn violence and GBV
2	Innovation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> First MIS-based strategies and programming to address VAWG and monitor progress First credible VAWG data used in NCSW and state reports on VAWG for Pakistan (dearth of/insufficient data for other forms of VAWG)
3	Impact	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Action/partnership serving as a model for other countries in the region/in the world to address acid & burn violence Due to effective and informed interventions, 50% decrease in this form of VAWG/GBV Quoted as an example of success by the EU, outcome documented for GSP+ evaluation
4	Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Data published and accessible, shared by NCSW and ASFP and other institutions Data developed and continuing via large notification network, functioning without donor support Included in the PCSW GMIS Included in the draft comprehensive acid & burn rehabilitation bill Staff trained on the MIS can share skills with others
5	Replicability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Model documented and available for replication in other countries or for other forms of VAWG
6	Gender Perspective	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The MIS and data and gender sensitive and gender disaggregated and data analysis allows gender focused strategies, legal and policy reform and programming Impact contributing to Pakistan success in achieving SDG 5
7	Child Sensitivity and Participation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> MIS include child gender disaggregated data Cases of acid/burn violence on children included MIS managed in line with child protection policy as per UNCRC standards Children involved in the action planning based on MIS analysis

PUNJAB COMMISSION ON THE STATUS OF WOMEN – ESTABLISHING THE FIRST MODEL GENDER MANAGEMENT INFORMATION SYSTEM

The Punjab Commission on the Status of Women ("PCSW") is a statutory, autonomous institution established in February 2014 under the Punjab Commission on the Status of Women Act, 2014 for the promotion of women's rights. After the 18th Amendment, policy areas related to the development and empowerment of women were transferred to the provinces. The Women Development Department and, subsequently, PCSW was set up and conceived as an oversight body. PCSW ensures that laws, policies and programs of the Government of Punjab (GoPB) promote women's empowerment; that efforts are made for expansion of opportunities for socio-economic development of women, and discrimination against women is eliminated.

PCSW's functions include reviewing laws, rules, policies and programs of the government to ensure gender sensitivity; providing redress; and monitoring implementation of women-related laws and policies for the achievement

of gender equality and elimination of discrimination. PCSW also provides periodical feedback and status updates on international instruments affecting women and girls, including the Convention on Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW), the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR), the Convention against Torture, International Labour Organization (ILO) Conventions, and the Convention on Rights of the Child.

Source:

https://pcsw.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/Best_Practices_GMIS.pdf

A key informant interview was conducted with Fouzia Viqar, Chairperson of Punjab Commission on the Status of Women to document their good practices:

Practice 1: Establishing the GMIS Indicator Framework

Process: The GMIS is the first such initiative in Asia where a comprehensive framework regarding women's rights has been adopted. GMIS is based on seven thematic areas against which gender equality and the status of women should be measured and analysed.²⁹ Indicators that fall within each of these thematic areas along with details as to specific definitions, sources, form of analysis together constitute the Indicator Framework, which forms the backbone of the GMIS.

No.	Criteria	Practice
1	Self-Fulfilling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Punjab Government owns the comprehensive framework for women rights adopted for GMIS and it is proud of its achievement for gender empowerment.
2	Innovation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The first of such initiative in Asia
3	Impact	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Promoting evidence based advocacy for advocacy, awareness, policy and legislation relating to gender equality and countering VAWG

²⁹ Thematic areas include: Demographics, Health, Education, Economic Participation and Opportunities, Justice Sector, Governance and Special Initiatives

4	Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The GMIS developed through a project but now funded and owned by the Government of Punjab
5	Replicability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The GMIS data available online on PCSW portal as well as documented in various reports Can be replicated in other provinces and at national level
6	Gender Perspective	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Indicator Framework covers all facets of gender and how gender disparities impact women rights
7	Child Sensitivity and Participation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Children related issues like education and issues of violence against girls included in the GMIS

Practice 2: GMIS: Data Collection

Process: The GMIS is based on a data collection mechanism where data is collected from provincial departments/institutions & district offices, specific indicators relating to one department/institution, all departments and offices (relating to Human Rights etc.); the data is required for monitoring the implementation status of all women and empowerment packages introduced by the government. The GMIS team has divisional presence in all divisions of Punjab with its Divisional Coordinators strategically placed within the Divisional Commissioners' offices.

No.	Criteria	Practice
1	Self-Fulfilling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Punjab Government owns and facilitates the sharing of data regarding women's rights
2	Innovation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Data collection portals or sources available within Punjab Government approached for GMIS data, first in Asia.
3	Impact	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Implementation of women rights related initiatives, laws and policies monitored and implemented Evidence based monitoring and tracking consolidated in State reports submitted to UN Treaty Bodies to highlight efforts being made for women rights
4	Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Existing data collection portals within the government utilised GMIS funded by the Government of Punjab
5	Replicability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The GMIS data available online on PCSW portal as well as documented in various reports Can be replicated in other provinces and at national level.
6	Gender Perspective	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The gathered data covers all facets of gender and how gender disparities impact women rights
7	Child Sensitivity and Participation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Children related issues like education and issues of violence against girls included in the GMIS

Practice 3: Punjab Gender Parity Report (PGPR)

Process: Data collected by the GMIS team is analysed and presented annually in the Punjab Gender Parity Report. Findings in the report highlight trends over time, implementation status of all women related policies introduced by the Punjab government and areas of concern. The Punjab Gender Parity Report has also been strategically launched through the Chief Minister's Secretariat to inculcate Punjab Government's ownership of the findings of the report.

No.	Criteria	Practice
-----	----------	----------

1	Self-Fulfilling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Punjab Government owns the data and analysis presented in the PGPR and is happy and motivated to be a trend setter
2	Innovation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PGPR conducts an annual analysis of data recorded in the GMIS, first in Asia.
	Impact	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PGPR provides evidence based and concrete recommendations to the Government of Punjab to improve status of women in the province Useful to help draft state report
3	Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> GMIS funded by the Government of Punjab
4	Replicability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The GMIS data available online on PCSW portal as well as documented in various reports Can be replicated in other provinces and at national level
5	Gender Perspective	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The PGPR covers all facets of gender and how gender disparities impact women rights
6	Child Sensitivity and Participation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Children related issues like education and issues of violence against girls included in the PGPR

During the key informant interview it was also highlighted that PCSW's next step would be to conduct a household surveys of 36000 houses to give a clear picture regarding the rights of women and girls and the opportunities given to women and girls. The household survey would also take into account the layers of

vulnerabilities that women and girls can be subjected to like disabilities, belonging from religious minorities groups or other marginalised groups; to generate a rich database for further analysis. This may be considered as an encouraging practice.

BENAZIR INCOME SUPPORT PROGRAMME – SOCIO-ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT OF WOMEN MOST AFFECTED BY POVERTY IN PAKISTAN

The BISP is the main social assistance programme in Pakistan and one of the largest in South Asia, serving 5.29 million beneficiaries. The Government of Pakistan launched the BISP in 2008 as its flagship national social safety net initiative, in recognition that the existing instruments (Pakistan Bait-ul-Mal and Zakat) had limited coverage and were poorly targeted. The BISP was launched with two main objectives: to cushion the adverse impact of the food, fuel and financial crisis on the poor; and a longer term objective of providing a minimum income

support package to the poorest and to those most vulnerable to future shocks.

The programme provides eligible families with unconditional cash transfers (UCT), originally set at a monthly value of PKR 1,000, raised to PKR 1,200 in July 2013, PKR 1,500 in July 2014 and PKR 1,566 in July 2015. The transfer is delivered quarterly, with the vast majority of beneficiaries receiving cash through the BISP Debit Card.

By providing access to Computerised National Identity Cards (CNIC) and making BISP payments to the female head of beneficiary

households the BISP made explicit the goal of the empowerment of women, which is complemented by the creation of BISP

Beneficiary Committees (BBC) that provide a forum for beneficiaries.

Practice 1: Scientifically identifying the deserving beneficiaries through Proxy Means Test (PMT)

Process: BISP uses the system of a Proxy Means Test to scientifically choose the poor as their beneficiaries. The formula was developed with the help of World Bank and includes a Poverty Score Card (PSC) through which potential beneficiaries are scored between 1 – 100. Anyone below the score of 15.17 becomes a BISP beneficiary.³⁰

No.	Criteria	Practice
1	Self-Fulfilling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Choosing women as beneficiaries provides them with an added value and an officially recognised role in sustaining the family, thus helping those women build self-confidence. BISP staff and decision makers, especially women, feel they are contributing to a good cause and are motivated to support and sustain the women's empowerment agenda
2	Innovation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Introducing science based and evidence based techniques to determine who is 'poor' and access public support services on a basis of merit Utilising and building upon indicators for determination of 'poor' for social safety net
3	Impact	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 5.5 million beneficiaries of BISP determined through this test 5.5 million beneficiaries of BISP becoming part of a social safety net in Pakistan, one of the biggest in the world
4	Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PMT promotes a scientific methodology to determine 'poor' rather than an influence-based & politicised referral system, so it is sustainable Largely funded by the Government of Pakistan to ensure sustainability
5	Replicability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recorded and documented by BISP as well as academicians, policy institutes and universities Seminars organised with international representatives to share information and experiences Applicable to other Muslim countries or countries from Asia, in particular South Asia.
6	Gender Perspective	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 5.5 million beneficiaries of BISP include mostly ever-married women therefore the initiative is heavily and consciously gender-based

³⁰ In general, PMTs use a set of easy to observe indicators that can accurately predict the welfare of the applicants. Each variable is assigned a certain score based statistical method, and the accumulation of all "individual scores" leads to the final result of the PMT. The existing PMT formula is based on 23 household variables and characteristics that reflect the applicants' level of wealth. Whereas the new PMT formula developed would employ 45 indicators. This will be used 2018 onwards.

The variables employed in existing PMT formula fall under the following 3 categories:

- Household and individual characteristics
- Ownership of durable goods and housing characteristics
- Ownership of proactive assets, especially land holding, livestock and farm equipment.

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Involvement of gender experts as advisors to provide technical input on how to improve BISP gender performance
7	Child Sensitivity and Participation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inclusion of components promoting children's education as part of the BISP safety net, action that inculcates child sensitivity and child rights to participation • Women beneficiaries involved with the experience sharing process were allowed to attend the events with their children

FOSPAH: CREATING DIGNIFIED WORK ENVIRONMENTS IN PAKISTAN

The Federal Ombudsman Secretariat (FOSPAH) has been established under section 7 of the Protection against Harassment of Women at the Workplace Act (PAHWA) 2010 to investigate and decide cases of sexual harassment at the work place. The Federal Ombudsman Secretariat is primarily governed by a combination of two laws: Protection against Harassment of Women at the Workplace Act 2010 and Federal Ombudsman Institutional Reform Act 2013. The latter grants FOSPAH substantial powers to enforce decisions and initiate contempt proceedings against organisations or individuals failing to comply with the Ombudsman's directions. The laws provide a comprehensive framework responding to the issue of sexual harassment with some unique features:

1. The legislation adopts a three-pronged definition of sexual harassment which includes abuse of authority, creating hostile environment and retaliation. Therefore, all facets of the issue of sexual harassment are covered in the law. Acts of retaliation subsequent to refusal to comply with sexual favours also constitutes as sexual harassment under the law.
2. Women as well as men or any other gender can file complaints of sexual harassment under the law.
3. The legislation also reflects cultural sensitivities surrounding issues of sexual harassment and provides a framework for deliberating complaints of sexual harassment within the organisations. Incentivised organisations are motivated to respond to complaints of sexual harassment within organisations in order to protect their workplace reputations.
4. The law also calls for the establishment of the Offices of Ombudsmen as original and appellate forum for cases of sexual harassment. In workplace environments where huge power disparity exists between the complainants and the accused (for example where the accused is part of the management); complaints of sexual harassment can be directly submitted to the Office of Ombudsman.
5. The last forum for cases of sexual harassment is the President at the federal level and Governor at the provincial levels. Therefore,





the legislative framework in the Act provides mechanisms to deal with complaints at forums independent of the mainstream judiciary keeping in view the gender and cultural sensitivities attached to cases of sexual harassment



Keeping in view the above, FOSPAH is tasked with deliberating upon cases of sexual harassment and has adopted various practices to implement the law in letter and spirit as well. Till date, a total of 432 complaints of sexual harassment have been decided upon by FOSPAH. Of the 432 complaints, 107 complainants were men whereas 325 complainants were women. Furthermore, of the total number of complaints, 3 were from unknown locations, 174 were from the federal area, 163 complaints were from Punjab, 57 were from Sindh, 28 were from Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (including FATA) and 7 were from Baluchistan.

41 complaints of sexual harassment are currently being entertained and followed up by

FOSPAH to curb sexual harassment. Of the 41 complainants, 31 are women and 10 are men. 20 complainants have been registered from federal, 17 from Punjab, 3 from Sindh and 1 from Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.



Against the backdrop of this data, the Federal Ombudsman is not only entertaining complaints of sexual harassment but also monitoring and facilitating organisations in setting up inquiry committees and institutionalising mechanisms to respond to complaints of sexual harassment within the organisation. FOSPAH has also initiated an outreach program to work with public and private sectors on preventing sexual harassment in the work place and creating a dignified work environment for all.

Before extrapolating the good practices identified during this research study, it is important to lay down some of the important decisions and judgments that have contributed to evolving the jurisprudence regarding sexual harassment in Pakistan. Decision dated 27-08-2018 in Complaint No. 1(469)/2018-FOS (Reg) filed online by Umama Fatima against Saadat Bashir is pertinent to mention here. The complaint was filed on 31st May 2018 by a student against Saadat Bashir who was a lecturer of Biology and Practical Examiner of

HSSC-II Examination. The Federal Ombudsman, Kashmala Tariq, took notice of the complaint and found statements of the complainant as well as other female students who reported incidents of sexual harassment against the respondent in the case. The case was also highlighted on social media and was able to attract substantial attention from public at large. In exercise of the powers conferred and in light of the findings, FOSPAH directed and recommended the following:

1. Imposed a major penalty on the respondent Saadat Bashir thereby dismissing him from service and levying a fine of Rs. 200,000;
2. Directed FDE and FBISE to provide psychological counselling to students who had been sexually harassed by the respondent;
3. Imposed minor penalty of warning to Head of Department of Biology of Bahria College, Ms. Saboohi Husain, for keeping silent and not reporting the actions of sexual harassment which were in her knowledge;
4. Directed Secretary FDE to have the Code of Conduct of the 2010 Act displayed in English and Urdu at conspicuous locations in colleges and examination halls in Islamabad;
5. Recommended re-take of Biology examination in light of the scandal.

The landmark decision has been celebrated by many in protecting young students from sexual harassment in educational institutions. The decision of FOSPAH highlighted the fact that the victims in the case were 'minors' therefore issued comprehensive directions and recommendations to address the severity of the case.

Furthermore, in a recent judgment by the Lahore High Court, the jurisdiction of the Federal Ombudsman has also been widened to accommodate the post-18th amendment context. In *Imran Maqbool versus Federal (?) of Pakistan* W.P No. 71556 of 2017 dated 28-09-2018, the Honourable Justice Ayesha A. Malik differentiated the instant case from the

Salim Javed judgment of the Lahore High Court and held that:

'Under the circumstances, we hold that if the employer or organisation and its workplace falls strictly within the territorial boundaries of the Provincial Ombudsman, then jurisdiction vests with the Provincial Ombudsman and where the employer or organisation transcends provincial boundaries such as in this case then jurisdiction vests with the Federal Ombudsman. To clarify we add that for reasons stated herein we disagree with the findings in the "Salim Javed" case that the Federal Ombudsman jurisdiction is limited to the federal capital area as the Federal Ombudsman is competent to hear complaints related to trans-provincial organisations, institutions, employers and workplace.'

Therefore, the landmark judgment of the Lahore High Court has clearly stipulated the jurisdictional boundaries of the Federal Ombudsman which includes trans-provincial organisations other than organisations operating in the federal capital.

A key informant interview was conducted with Federal Ombudsman's Legal Adviser, Owais Awan, to document the good and promising practices adopted by the organisation. In this regard, a good practice identified during discussions was their practice of issuing Orders to organisations to comply with the law during preliminary hearings of the cases and their online complaint form and referral mechanism. At the preliminary stage of any case, before even delving into any investigation or inquiry, the Ombudsman, utilising its strategic powers under the law, issues an Order to organisations to comply with the Protection against Harassment of Women at the Workplace Act 2010 (PAHWA) and to constitute inquiry committees to inquire into complaints of sexual harassment.

This has created a culture of facilitating implementation of the law by FOSPAH. As the jurisprudence regarding the jurisdiction of FOSPAH is evolving, another practice identified was that the Secretariat facilitates complainants by referring their complaints to

the relevant forum which has legal jurisdiction to entertain their complaints. The practices have therefore been incorporated in the research study as examples of good practice and fulfil the established criteria as propounded below:

Practice 1: Passing Orders for Respondent Organisations to implement PAHWA

Process: In the preliminary stages of the complaints of sexual harassment, the respondent organisation is called by FOSPAH and asked whether PAHWA has been implemented in the organisation or not. If not, an Order is passed by the Ombudsman to ensure compliance with the law by constituting an Inquiry Committee, designating a Competent Authority and incorporating the Code of Conduct in their workplace policies

No.	Criteria	Practice
1	Self-Fulfilling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Organisations and management sensitized to deal with issues of sexual harassment and feeling they are contributing to a better society Organisations and management sensitized to understand gender-power differentials at workplaces and growing out of the learning process
2	Innovation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proactive role by the Federal Ombudsman to implement the 2010 Act through a pedagogical approach Federal Ombudsman utilising judicial powers to create dignified work environments for working men and women with focused goals that translate into tangible actions
3	Impact	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improved working environments Creating a culture of gender sensitized workplaces in Pakistan
4	Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Orders and Judgements made part of public record & utilised by lawyers to argue as precedents for other similar cases Non-compliance with Orders can result in contempt proceedings as per powers conferred in the Federal Ombudsperson Institutional Reform Act 2013
5	Replicability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All proceedings documented and recorded to facilitate replication by provincial Ombudsmen
6	Gender Perspective	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Gender perspective woven into definition of sexual harassment in the law and made part of Orders and Judgements for complainants Orders for implementation of PAHWA infuse gender perspective in work place policies of organisations
7	Child Sensitivity and Participation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The implementation of Orders by organisations protects interns or apprentices under the age of 18 years at work places The implementation of Orders also protects young students and children from predatory sexual harassment behaviours

Practice 2: Online Complaint and Referral Mechanism

Process: FOSPAH has an updated Online Complaint Mechanism. The complaints filed by complainants are designed to differentiate between service matters, administrative issues, cyber-crimes and sexual harassment. The complaints are referred to the correct forum or the complainants are made aware of the correct forum by FOSPAH in order to enhance understanding of complainants regarding what constitutes 'sexual harassment'.

No.	Criteria	Practice
1	Self-Fulfilling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Online Complaint Mechanism empowers complainants to file complaints regarding their issues with easy accessibility • The complainants are sensitized about actions that constitute 'sexual harassment' as opposed to issues regarding terms of employment contract and feel acknowledged as citizens who deserve justice and respect
2	Innovation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Online Complaint Mechanism ensures record and management of data pertaining to complaints • The Referral Mechanism ensures that the complainants are made aware of their legal options with regard to their issues
3	Impact	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Online Complaint Mechanism increases accessibility of FOSPAH by working citizens. • The Referral Mechanism increases technical understanding and sensitization regarding the parameters of 'sexual harassment'
4	Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The decisions and judgments based on online complaints become part of public record (the complaint against Saadat Bashir was filed online) • The updated complaint form is complemented by a referral matrix for FOSPAH staff as well
5	Replicability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The practice is recorded and easy accessible to be replicated by other provincial Ombudsmen
6	Gender Perspective	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Online Complaint Mechanism and Referral Mechanism focus on elaborating 'sexual harassment' in terms of the gender power differential between parties in the complaints
7	Child Sensitivity and Participation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Online Complaint Mechanism and Referral Mechanism seeks to cater to the issues of young men and women, including children (the complaint against Saadat Bashir was filed online)

FOSPAH's dynamic initiatives have yielded landmark decisions, the promising practices highlighted during the key informant interview also included FOSPAH's Outreach Program. Through the Outreach Program, the Ombudsman Kashmala Tariq, has signed various Memorandum of Understanding with the public and private sector to facilitate organisations in preventing sexual harassment at workplaces and creating dignified work

environments. FOSPAH is also in the process of formulating surveys to gauge responsiveness of the current mechanisms to the need of working men and women. MoUs have also been signed with academic and research institutes as well to encourage academic scholarship related to sexual harassment in Pakistan. The promising practices being formulated by FOSPAH can be a point of research in future to determine whether they

can be recorded as good practices for institutions to replicate.

AASHA: MOVEMENT BASED AND COLLABORATIVE APPROACH FOR THE PROMULGATION OF THE ANTI-SEXUAL HARASSMENT IN THE WORKPLACE LAWS IN PAKISTAN.

Today in Pakistan, sexual harassment is defined as “any unwelcome sexual advance, request for sexual favours or other verbal or physical conduct of a sexual nature, when it interferes with work, is made a condition of employment or creates an intimidating, hostile or offensive work environment.”³¹ Sexual harassment can take many forms and may include, but is not limited to: unwelcome sexual advances, the forcing of sexual attention, verbal or physical, on an unwilling person; or the attempt to punish the refusal to comply.

Civil society in Pakistan, particularly women rights organizations, demanded legal protection for women against sexual harassment. Alliance Against Sexual Harassment (AASHA) has been a voluntary movement in the forefront of the struggle to secure this legal right. The ten-year AASHA movement culminated in the promulgation of legislation to criminalise and address sexual harassment in the country. As a result of AASHA's persistent and decade long effort, in 2010, the Parliament of Pakistan enacted a much needed legislation: Protection against Harassment of Women at the Workplace Act 2010 and Criminal Law Amendment 2010 in section 509 of the Pakistan Penal Code. AASHA's important strategies to achieve its goal included:

1. **Inclusivity:** AASHA included both men, women and at times non-binary and gender variant people gathered around the issue of sexual harassment. While the main target beneficiary were working women, the movement ensured that both men and women own the issue of sexual harassment.
2. **Clarity of the Goal:** AASHA's focus remained a legislative cover to address and criminalise sexual harassment throughout the decade long movement.
3. **Avoidance of Donor Funding:** In order to function autonomously with a volunteer spirit, AASHA avoided donor funding.
4. **Strategic Lobbying:** AASHA identified and approached only parliamentarians, senators and ministers who held a position with authority and respect in their respective parties, and who were likely to support their cause. All the political parties were approached in this manner and once key people from each party were on board, they were given the responsibility to approach other key peers in their party.
5. **Co-operation with the Government:** AASHA's engagement with the government took the form of cooperation and collaboration, in stark contrast to the adversarial and rather antagonistic relationship that has traditionally existed between civil society and the government.
6. **A Cut-Off Point:** AASHA was not an NGO but an alliance of like-minded people who came together to meet a specific goal. Although AASHA met its primary goal when the sexual harassment legislation was passed in 2010, its members' decision to use the momentum that had been built

³¹ Protection against Harassment of Women at the Workplace Act 2010

and to make use of the alliance's significant clout to facilitate the implementation process was a strategic decision. The goal was never to continue indefinitely or turn into an NGO and therefore, an announcement that the alliance would dissolve in early 2012 was made in 2010.

The promulgation of the anti-sexual harassment laws was a great victory for AASHA, but the Alliance did not stop its struggle here and decided to continue its efforts for the effective implementation of the newly enacted pro-women laws. The Alliance against Sexual Harassment (AASHA), through its secretariat and hub at Mehargarh, entered into a second round of struggle. It initiated the effort to set up support mechanisms for women complainants at federal and provincial levels. The AASHA Secretariat, under the leadership of Dr. Fouzia Saeed, formulated a National Implementation Framework to guide organisations in implementing the laws. The major features of AASHA's Implementation Strategies included the following:

1. **National Implementation Watch Committee:** The persistent efforts by AASHA's Secretariat, Mehargarh, resulted into the formation of the National Implementation Watch Committee (NIWC) on the platform of National Commission on the Status of Women. The 30-member committee formed by the Prime Minister to facilitate and monitor compliance with the anti-sexual harassment legislation, comprised representatives of civil society, private sector, government and media organizations. It met every three months to determine the status of the implementation of these laws and which areas to focus on for facilitation.
2. **Rules for Protection against Harassment of Women at the Workplace Act 2010:** The drafting of rules for "Protection against Harassment of Women at Workplace, Act 2010" by AASHA in collaboration with the government, pursuing the approval process and the subsequent issuance of notification in this regard by the then federal Ministry of Women Development (MOWD), in January 2011, was a major step towards the development of mechanisms for implementation.
3. **Implementation through Regulatory Bodies:** The Prime Minister's Secretariat immediately issued a notification in April 2010 to all the federal ministries and government bodies. Some of these regulatory bodies and ministries that sent out a formal notification for compliance with the anti-harassment legislation included:
 - i. The Federation of Pakistan Chamber of Commerce & Industry
 - ii. State Bank of Pakistan
 - iii. Ministry of Education (Federal)
 - iv. Ministry of Health (Federal)
 - v. PEMRA (Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority)
 - vi. Pakistan Telecommunications Authority
4. **Establishment of the Office of Ombudsperson:** The appointment of a Federal Ombudsperson was termed as the most important step towards setting up support mechanisms for the implementation of the anti-sexual sexual harassment law. For AASHA it was a great achievement to have a woman, Ms. Mussarat Hillali from Malakand, as the first Federal Ombudsperson. The Prime Minister appointed her on 22nd December, 2010.
5. **Web-Based Monitoring Mechanism:** A Web-based modest database service was developed by AASHA Secretariat, Mehargarh, for the Implementation Watch Committee to initiate some kind of a monitoring system. The objective was to develop a system for monitoring and also to make it transparent and accessible to all.

AASHA/Mehargarh team, members and supporters showed strong commitment to the issue and the promotion of awareness about legislation among various stakeholders by involving almost all sectors and sections of society. It struggled for the adoption of the

Code of Conduct against sexual harassment in various departments of public domain and within private organizations. During the key informant interview with Maliha Husain,

Executive Director, Mehergarh, one particularly interesting example of good practice was identified regarding the AASHA movement.

Practice 1: Co-operation and Partnership with the Government and Political Stakeholders

Process: AASHA opted for an approach of co-operation and partnership with government stakeholders, rather than antagonising them. The movement made the government and political stakeholders partners in the process of promulgating the anti-sexual harassment laws and sensitized them on women issues in the process.

No.	Criteria	Practice
1	Self-Fulfilling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Government functionaries and parliamentarians sensitised on women issues, feel they are serving their country and a good cause by supporting AASHA objectives.
2	Innovation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> For the first time, government given credit and ownership of the achievements demanded by a civil society movement AASHA members worked in the background without claiming any credit to ensure government's ownership Taxonomy of Sexual Harassers – Shifting the Spotlight on Perpetrators; for the first time, the perpetrator and not the victim was exposed in the media.
3	Impact	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Legal reform which led to an increased reporting and provision of justice and support in the country for victims of Sexual Harassment
4	Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Government functionaries and political stakeholders' support increased to partner with other CSOs for promulgation of other pro-women laws and to stop VAWG in the long term AASHA's model was disseminated via various media campaigns, documentaries, case studies, etc Capacity building inherent to the AASHA process, so retention of knowledge and peer to peer effect ensured
5	Replicability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> AASHA's experience of co-operation and partnership with government documented in the report titled 'The AASHA Experience' to be duplicated by other organisations
6	Gender Perspective	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The practice addressed gender power differentials in working spaces through the government Within the movement, men, women, non-binary and gender variant persons were included
7	Child Sensitivity and Participation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The movement included youth and sensitisations and training sessions were targeting youth.

EVAWG ALLIANCE – USING SOCIAL MEDIA TO ADDRESS VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN IN POLITICS

EVAWG Alliance is a national network of Civil Society Organizations and individuals doing advocacy/lobby for ending violence against women and girls in Pakistan. It was initially set up in collaboration with UN Women.

This alliance is envisaged to function as a coordination platform on ending violence against women and girls particularly in relation to provincial, national and international commitments on gender equality through:

- i. Making EVAWG a priority at national level
- ii. Monitoring state commitments on EVAWG at all levels
- iii. Lobbying and advocating for policy and legislative reforms on VAWG through involvement and engagement of National and provincial women machineries

A key informant interview was conducted with the Co-Chair of EVAWG Alliance, Anbreen Ajaib, to document the role of the alliance in raising awareness regarding violence against women in politics.

Practice: Using Social Media to Engage with Political Stakeholders and Decision Makers regarding Violence against Women and Girls

Process: In the recent political landscape of Pakistan, incidents of violence against women in politics (VAWIP) were highlighted; political/influential personnel accused or even convicted of rape/sexual assault were rewarded prominent positions by political parties; general sexist comments were being uttered by influential political personnel. In this regard, EVAWG Alliance utilised the power of social media and advocacy to address violence against women in the political circles of Pakistan in order to encourage political participation of women.

No.	Criteria	Practice
1	Self-Fulfilling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Political stakeholders being sensitized regarding sexism and violence against women and girls; motivated to contribute to a good cause Women and girls feeling empowered and encouraged to defend their political rights as feeling recognised and supported
2	Innovation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Use of information communication technology and strategic advocacy to address violence against women and girls perpetrated by political stakeholders and report identified violations
3	Impact	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Several positive decisions and notices taken by political party leadership regarding complaints of sexism and violence against women and girls Cancellation of elections when less than 10% women voted Identified data was also shared with NCSW & other Civil society networks for reports on "Women and general elections 2018 in Pakistan"

4	Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decisions by political party leadership has created important Precedents to be used by alliances and civil society for Advocacy for next elections • Increased momentum to support women's right to vote and their political empowerment • The work was conducted with no funding and through a group of volunteers, members of EAWG alliance.
5	Replicability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Several media reports highlighted the advocacy strategy by EAWG Alliance and other human rights activists
6	Gender Perspective	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • EAWG Alliance action on social media has infused gender perspective within political debates • Violence against transgender was also highlighted
7	Child Sensitivity and Participation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Youth engagement was a key component in this activity. Young women were encouraged to exercise their right to vote, especially the ones who voted for the first time as they had attained majority (18 years) during the last 5 years

The key informant interview with Anbreen Ajaib also highlighted the strategic advocacy and use of social media being employed by the Alliance in putting gender issues at the forefront of political debates. The methodology that divided tasks and geographical responsibilities for promoting women's political rights and monitor their enforcement during the general elections also turned out to be very effective. When

violations were identified head of political parties and NCSW or PCSW were immediately contacted and cases reported to relevant authorities for immediate action. With 40% turn out of women to cast their vote, and only two constituencies where less than 105 women voted, the awareness and M&E process conducted by EAWG on social media turned out to be an example of encouraging good practice.

ACID SURVIVORS FOUNDATION PAKISTAN: TRANSFORMING SURVIVORS OF ACID AND BURN CRIMES INTO EMPOWERED CITIZENS

Acid Survivors Foundation Pakistan (ASFP) was founded in 2006 with the help of a UK-based organisation: Acid Survivors Trust International to support survivors of acid and burn attacks in Pakistan. ASFP is a Pakistani non-profit organization working to eradicate acid and burn violence and GBV in general from Pakistan. It promotes human rights of acid and other burn survivors, through a peaceful, creative, inclusive, eco-friendly and democratic process. ASFP mandate is to work with multiple relevant stakeholders towards the elimination of acid violence in particular and GBV at a larger level, and towards the

empowerment of survivors, women and children in particular, so that they can exercise their fundamental human rights in an environment friendly society. ASFP follows a culture sensitive, holistic, developmental and human rights based approach. It has articulated its work around the following programmes: comprehensive tailor-made empowerment, evidence-based and beneficiary-led advocacy and lobbying for policy and legal reform, capacity building, preventive diplomacy, child protection. Acid and burn violence is a particularly outrageous form of torture which involves

throwing corrosive acid, usually at the victims' face or trying to burn someone with any other heating substance. This not only causes disfigurement but also has a catastrophic effect on the victims' life. It usually occurs as one of the worst form of domestic violence and is most often directed against women, but children-especially girls- are also targeted; men may also be among the victims. The effects of acid and burn violence include serious physical harm (loss of eyes and limbs, corrosion of organs, and subsequent infections). Acid and burn survivors are disfigured for life. In addition to the inevitable

psychological trauma, survivors face social isolation and ostracism that further damages their self-esteem and seriously undermines their economic, professional and personal future. According to ASFP's MIS database, for the year 2017, there has been a total of 71 victims of acid and burn attacks out of which 48 are victims of acid attacks, 14 are victims of fire burns, 1 is a victim of chemical burn, 1 is a victim of hot water or contact burn and 3three cases where the cause of burn is unknown. The profile of victims based on gender and maturity for acid attacks reveals the following:

Acid Violence: Profile of Victims based on Gender and Maturity (2017)				
Description	Total	Men/Boys	Women/Girls	Transgender Persons
Adults	37	23	13	1
Children	11	4	7	0

ASFP has worked to address the structural, institutional and socio-cultural aspects of VAWG & GBV as well as protection and promotion of women and girls' rights. ASFP has been the lead organisation that worked for the promulgation and implementation of the Acid and Burn Crimes Criminal Amendment 2011. Its model includes a mechanism of transforming victims of acid violence to survivors and empowered citizens. ASFP's work has sought to enforce CEDAW and UNCRC in Pakistan, its model for rehabilitation of survivors of acid and burn violence has received international acclaim. In 2017, the EIDHR (European Instrument for Democracy and Human Rights) has nominated ASFP as a success story in the entire world to model, since ASFP's work and collaboration with state stakeholders – among which the National Commission on the Status of Women- has led to 50% decrease in acid violence in Pakistan since 2014. ASFP's landmark initiatives and work in Pakistan has led to some major

achievements that can be replicated by other organisations:

1. Promulgation of the Criminal Law Amendment 2011 on Acid and Burn Crimes through synergic and survivors' led legal advocacy.
2. Total number of reported attacks dropping by roughly 50% in 2015 and 2016 which is a major success story for acid violence and countering VAWG in Pakistan.
3. The percentage of attack survivors reaching a hospital within 24 hours of attack reached 100% in 2016.
4. Conviction rate has significantly increased, from 17.3% of total registered cases in 2013, to 30.43% in 2016 (nearly doubled).

Key informant interviews were conducted with Faqir Mohammad Khan, Executive Director ASFP, and two survivors of acid and burn crimes. The main crux of ASFP's work was reflected in the statement of one of the survivors who stated that *'after seeking ASFP's help I have realised that I am a full human being. My life hasn't ended after this incident,*

it has only started and I have a long way to go to work for others like me who need help and who should be empowered.' In this regard, the following example of good practices was identified during the interview.

Practice: Beneficiary led advocacy and lobbying for legal and policy reform to address acid and burn violence

Process: The "Naila Farhat" case was taken to the Human Rights Cell of the Supreme Court by Naila Farhat, with support from ASFP and UNDP. It was a "test case" (in appeal) to challenge the reduction in sentence of the perpetrator of the acid violence. The case also highlighted legislative gaps in the legal framework for rights of acid and burn survivors. The then Honourable Chief Justice of Pakistan, Mr Iftikhar Chaudhry, issued a judgment highlighting the need to revise the legal framework of Pakistan with regards to acid and burn crimes and also overruled the judgement of the High Court which reduced the sentence of the perpetrator in Naila's case. The case was greatly highlighted in the media and successful in seeking institutional, social and political support for the rights of acid and burn survivors in Pakistan.

No.	Criteria	Practice
1	Self-Fulfilling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sensitized senior judiciary regarding the gender manifestations of acid and burn crimes and feeling part of a positive transformative process • Survivor gaining self-confidence and feeling empowered after winning this case and getting what she considers as justice
2	Innovation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A "Test case" was used to achieve a jurisprudence that was then used as evidence for further advocacy against acid and burn violence, VAWG and GBV • Acid and burn violence was given a human/women's face
3	Impact	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Supreme Court judgment served as an essential advocacy tool with political stakeholders to promulgate the acid and burn crime legislation in 2011 and inspired other countries in the region • The Supreme Court judgement still serves as an important judicial precedent extrapolating the plight of acid and burn survivors and state responsibility • The victim's story and victory encouraged other victims to come forward and fight for their rights
4	Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The "Naila Farhat case" is part of the Supreme Court's judgments and is used as a reference for the rights of acid and burn survivors till date • Activists and survivors are involved beyond the length of donors' funded project • Experience acquired by activists during this experience has been retained and shared with other to be applied to other issues.
5	Replicability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The landmark case of Naila Farhat has been documented by media, Supreme Court judgement and ASF for replication • The strategy of "test cases" has been replicated with encouraging outcomes for other human rights issues

6	Gender Perspective	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The practice incorporated gender perspective in the Supreme Court judgment regarding acid and burn violence and women were leading the initiative
7	Child Sensitivity and Participation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Naila Farhat was fourteen year old when she was attacked with acid. The practice therefore, ensured child participation as well as child sensitivity in gaining institutional support. Youth were involved in the movement All ASFP activities abide by a child protection policy aligned with UNCRC principles.

Moreover, ASFP's MIS system can in itself be assessed as an example of good practice; it has supported not only a robust monitoring of implementation of the acid and burn crime legislation but also evidence based programming and advocacy for acid and burn crimes survivors. This will be addressed in another example of good practice in this report. ASFP is one of the only organisations that presents us with a model which starts

from reporting and facilitation in cases of acid and burn crimes to tailor-made and beneficiary-centered rehabilitation and reintegration support to acid and burn survivors in Pakistan. The holistic and comprehensive framework practised by ASFP provides a system of transforming acid and burn victims into survivors and then empowered citizens.

GROUP DEVELOPMENT PAKISTAN – PILOTING AND INSTITUTIONALISING CHILD PARTICIPATION IN HUMAN RIGHTS ADVOCACY

Group Development Pakistan (GDP) is a Pakistani child rights organisation that believes in a democratic and humanistic society in which the most important stakeholders, children, are acknowledged, respected and protected from abuse and discrimination. GDP follows a holistic, child focused and human rights based approach. GDP avails a strong and unique expertise in building/improving institutional and technical capacities using professional, scientific, creative, user-friendly, participatory, and inclusive culture sensitive methods. GDP also strongly believes in developing synergies and enhancing positive communication to promote collaboration between state institutions and civil society, media, community, members, corporate entities, artists, youth, children, academia and

donors to generate positive systemic change in order to promote and protect child rights.

GDP has implemented ground breaking initiatives for child rights in the country. In the area of legal/policy advocacy GDP has played a central role in the advocacy for promulgation of the Criminal Law Amendment Act 2016 which criminalises certain acts of violence against children (child sexual abuse, neglect, child pornography, trafficking), the National Commission on the Rights of the Child (NCRC) 2017, Juvenile Justice Act 2018 and the Islamabad Capital Territory (ICT) Child Protection Act 2018. With its intervention with the higher judiciary, GDP has helped establish the first ever pilot child court to subsume practices of child sensitivity in the judiciary of

Pakistan. GDP is also contributing to the draft of the SAARC regional strategy on Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation and Online Safety in collaboration with National Action Coordination Group (NACG) Pakistan and South Asian Initiative to Eradicate Violence against Children (SAIEVAC), and on other child focused policy documents. GDP has joined hands with Acid Survivors Foundation (ASF) to constitute the first ever Human Rights Children and Youth Task Force (HRCYTF) to engage children and youth in protecting their rights and build linkages with the federal Ministry of Human Rights and some provincial departments/entities. The Human Rights Children and Youth Task Force (HRCYTF) worked with the Ministry of Human Rights and for the first time, the International Human Rights Conference 2018 in Islamabad ensured child and youth participation in the Conference and in the Working Groups. This was remarkably noted by the Child rights international representatives who attended

the event. Overall, GDP articulates its work around four main components: evidence-based policy and legal reform, capacity building, networking and child participation. Key informant interviews were conducted with Valerie Khan, Executive Director, GDP and three child activists who have been part of GDP's initiatives. The key informant interviews revealed several good practices that can be incorporated or replicated by stakeholders with regards to child participation and children's empowerment. The interviews revealed a major shift in paradigm of the interviewees who did not view children from a paternalistic point of view requiring protection only, but believed in empowering children to protect themselves and becoming part of the processes to realise their rights in the country. Discussions revealed the following good practices that are a welcomed addition to the current body of practices regarding child rights:

Practice 1: Child Participation in Policy and Legal Reform Processes

Process: GDP has been a critical player in lobbying and advocacy with government and Parliamentarians for promulgation of laws for the rights of children. In this regard, a major feature of GDP's lobbying and advocacy has been child participation where children repeatedly presented their demands to the decision makers for the protection of their rights.

No.	Criteria	Practice
1	Self-Fulfilling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Government and Parliamentarians understand the importance of child rights more and participation and feel they are part of good Pakistan agenda Children feel motivated and proud of their efforts for the betterment of the country with tangible results
2	Innovation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> With children and youth input, and in collaboration with Acid Survivors Foundation (ASF), GDP set up a Human Rights and Children Youth Task Force in the country to promote and protect child rights
3	Impact	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Several laws for children were passed by the Parliament and children activists were officially included as stakeholders and participants in the International Human Rights Conference held in 2018

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increased support for safe, meaningful and inclusive child participation in the country: two children involved in the board of NCRC
4	Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Strategic linkages created with the government by GDP serve as a link between child participants and decision makers on the long term Other Civil Service Organisations (CSOs), networks, inspired by the model replicated the principle Schools have contacted GDP to extent cooperation to this effect without donor funding Children engaged sensitise and mobilise their peers
5	Replicability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The practice has been documented in various research studies/reports by GDP
6	Gender Perspective	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The child participants include girls, boys, transgender, intersex as well as gender variant children to put forward the perspective of all marginalised groups Gender equality is on the main areas of focus for the HRCYTF
7	Child Sensitivity and Participation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The practice is governed by a child protection policy aligned with international child protection standards

The key informant interviews revealed major shifts in paradigm with regards to child rights. The promising practices noted during the interviews included the establishment of a

pilot child court in Lahore which may be up-scaled and replicated. The conception of child courts can in time be documented as a good practice as, if successful, it would revolutionise the juvenile justice system in Pakistan.

STRENGTHENING PARTICIPATORY ORGANISATION: STRATEGIC ADVOCACY WITH SINDH GOVERNMENT AND ASSEMBLY MEMBERS TO ESTABLISH THE SINDH PROVINCIAL COMMISSION ON THE STATUS OF WOMEN

Strengthening Participatory Organization (SPO) has 20 years of experience in working with government quarters, policy makers and legislators to devise policies and influence the policy discourse on women, minorities, child rights and marginalized groups in Pakistan. It has been instrumental in establishing key players in various government and non-governmental policy making spheres and is known for its efforts in public policy discourse building and forwarding the agenda of human rights from micro to macro level e.g. intently coordinating with Local Government bodies at

union council level to district administration to provincial and national level.

The Sindh Commission on the Status of Women Bill, 2015 was passed by the Provincial Assembly of Sindh on 6th of April, 2015 and assented by the Governor of Sindh on 12th of May, 2015 and published as an Act of the Legislature of Sindh. As per this Act, the Sindh Government shall constitute a Commission to be known as the Sindh Provincial Commission on the Status of Women (SPCSW), to exercise the powers conferred upon, and to perform

the functions assigned to it. The Commission aims to promote social, economic, political & legal rights of women as provided in the Constitution of Pakistan and ratified in international declarations, conventions, treaties & agreements relating to women, including the Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW).

In order to implement the law and have the Sindh Commission on the Status of Women notified, SPO put forward the following good practice which was documented in a key informant interview with Shazia Shaheen of SPO.

Practice: Formation of the Provincial Steering Committee (PSC) for Effective Lobbying and Advocacy for Implementation of Pro-Women Laws

Process: The PSC included the Women Development Department (WDD), Social Welfare Department (SWD), Ministry of Human Rights, Home department, Police, Health, Finance and Planning and Development (P&D) as well as human rights organizations and media. The nomenclature of PSC ensured government's guidance in approaching the right people for lobbying and advocacy.

No.	Criteria	Practice
1	Self-Fulfilling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provincial government, civil society and media building synergies for a common goal and feeling as part of a process that serves the best interest of the country, especially women decision makers
2	Innovation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PSC improved strategic positioning and interventions of CSOs with the state institutions at provincial and grass root level for women and girls' rights agenda
3	Impact	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Sindh Commission on the Status of Women notified and established The Chairperson of the Sindh Commission on the Status of Women notified Institutionalisation of an accountability mechanism for women and girls' rights within 18th amendment framework
4	Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Synergies developed through PSC carried beyond project life Budget for SCSW allocated through PSC's lobbying and advocacy
5	Replicability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PSC's success and strategies documented by SPO in its report may be documented for same/other issues and/or other provinces
6	Gender Perspective	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PSC's formulation included civil society organisations working on gender and women rights to ensure a gender sensitive process
7	Child Sensitivity and Participation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Youth involved in the advocacy and lobbying process Agenda of the commission includes girls' rights

CONCLUSION

The various examples of good practices to counter VAWG & GBV in Pakistan that have been highlighted in this report, stand as testimonies of the tremendous efforts made by state actors and civil society to effectively and efficiently challenge the status quo. Those good practices, however, are not exhaustive: ASFP and the NCSW will continue their efforts to periodically identify and assess what models may be shared to inspire other interventions and scale up quality and impact oriented actions to promote gender equality and stop VAWG in Pakistan. It is also crucial to realise that sharing and disseminating those practices does not mean that our problems are solved: VAWG as a form of GBV is still a rampant, ill-addressed issue in our country; it has yet to be significantly tackled by the state as a human rights and developmental priority that is pivotal for Pakistan's geo-political standing and prosperity. Several key features have emerged from those good practices:

- MIS based interventions for informed, evidence based and strategic planning/interventions
- Movements that lead advocacy actions which are not donor dependent
- "test case" and jurisprudence that serve as evidence/starting point for impactful advocacy
- Beneficiary led/focused movements resulting in human connectivity and successful legal reform
- Partnership between CSOs and state actors that ensure sustainable, efficient outcomes
- Use of economic and trade incentives to promote women and girls' rights

- Children and youth participation to ensure informed and sustainable legal reform
- Use of new technology to identify beneficiaries and monitor the quality and progress of the action and/or notify and address complaints
- Peer to peer support
- Redressal mechanism embedded in the law to provide state institution with a cognitive and pedagogical tool to ensure enforcement of women and girls' rights
- Positive engagement of state actors as agents of change to address women and girl's rights violations

Overall, those good practices underline the importance of synergies, evidence-based actions, new technologies and inclusiveness which feed positive citizenry and the commitment to fight VAWG and GBV in Pakistan. More than ever, this report conveys a realistic, prudent but long awaited message of pride and hope for all Pakistani citizens. Change is possible. Dedication, honesty and hard work is required. We are looking forward to the next edition of this mapping, with hopefully an even more elaborate process to gather those examples of good practices, and wish you all more power to build the Pakistan we are all working for: a country where any citizen regardless of sex, gender, ethnical origin, religion or socio-economic belonging can access and exercise his/her fundamental rights, in accordance with Mohammad Ali Jinnah's vision, our Constitution and our international obligations.

ANNEX 1: LIST OF DOCUMENTS REVIEWED

1. "Good practices in combating and eliminating violence against women", United Nations Division for the Advancement of Women, Report of the expert group meeting (2005)
<http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/egm/vaw-gp-2005/docs/FINALREPORT.goodpractices.pdf>
2. Terms of Reference for Synthesis and Documentation of Lesson Learnt and Good Practices of the Bridging Phase of UN Joint Programme on Gender Based Violence "A Multi sectoral approach to Gender Based Violence Prevention and Response" (2016)
<http://uganda.unfpa.org/sites/default/files/submissions/ToR%20for%20synthesised%20good%20practice%20documentation%20Final.pdf>
3. Collection of methods, tools and good practices in the field of domestic violence (as described by area D of Beijing Platform for Action) <http://eige.europa.eu/gender-based-violence/eiges-studies-gender-based-violence/collection-methods-tools-and-good-practices-field-domestic-violence-described-area-d-beijing-platform-action>
4. Exchange of good practices and legal instruments in the fight against Gender-Based Violence between Norway, Iceland and Spain (2014)
[https://www.msssi.gob.es/en/ssi/violenciaGenero/Documentacion/otrosInformes/DOC/Segundo_borrador_preliminar_\(english\).pdf](https://www.msssi.gob.es/en/ssi/violenciaGenero/Documentacion/otrosInformes/DOC/Segundo_borrador_preliminar_(english).pdf)
5. Keeping Adrift: Documenting Best Practices for Addressing Gender Based Violence from the Platform of Women Friendly Spaces, Shirkat Gah. 2011
6. Acid Violence Statistics, ASF (2017)
7. Impact Study on Media Campaign, ASF
8. Preventing domestic violence: Good practices, European Institute for Gender Equality (2015)
9. Good Practices: Gender Equality in Basic Education and Lifelong Learning through CLCs (2003)
<http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0013/001316/131633e.pdf>
10. UNICEF Report for Kenya (2012)
https://www.unicef.org/about/annualreport/files/Kenya_COAR_2012.pdf
11. The AASHA Experience (2012)
12. Piloting an Intervention to counter Child Labour in one Slum of Lahore, GD Pakistan (2014)
13. Acid Violence in Pakistan: A Situational Analysis, ASF (2015)
14. Acid Violence: Fostering Effective Implementation of Pro-Women and Girls' Laws, ASF (2014)
15. Countering Acid Burn Violence in Pakistan: A Success Story, ASF (2017)
16. Constitution of Pakistan, 1973
17. United Nations Human Rights Committee, Concluding observations on the initial report of Pakistan, 2017
18. Universal Declaration of Human Rights
19. L. Corrieri, The Law, Patriarchy and Religious Fundamentalism: Women Right's in Pakistan (Asian Legal Resource Center 2013)
20. Istanbul Convention
21. Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 'Concluding Observations On The Initial Report Of Pakistan' (United Nations 2017)
22. Committee on Elimination of Discrimination against Women, 'Concluding observations on the fourth periodic report of Pakistan, adopted by the Committee at its fifty-fourth session' (United Nations 2013)

23. Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, 'Concluding Observations On The Combined Twenty-First To Twenty-Third Periodic Reports Of Pakistan' (United Nations 2016)
24. Committee on the Rights of the Child, 'Concluding observations on the fifth periodic report of Pakistan' (United Nations 2016)
25. Committee against Torture, 'Concluding Observations On The Initial Report Of Pakistan' (United Nations 2017)

ANNEX 2: CHILDREN AND YOUNG PEOPLE (ETHICAL GUIDANCE)

Source: <https://www.edgehill.ac.uk/research/files/2012/05/Ethics-Output-Guidance-Children-and-Young-People-RO-GOV-10.pdf> and Acid Survivors Foundation Pakistan Child Protection Policy

Choice

- Children and young people have the right to be informed, to express a view and to influence decisions.
- Information about research should be provided in a language style that is accessible to the specific age group of children from whom consent is sought.
- It should be clear that if a young person declines participation at any stage their relationship with those around them will not be affected.
- Children or young people should be provided with time to question about how participation in the research will affect them or their parent/guardian.

Consent

- Research with children and young people should be carried out with appropriate informed consent.
- Despite the absence of a law outlining the process for obtaining consent, the 'competence principle' demands that it must be established that an individual is competent to consent to research. This means that the researcher must ensure that the opportunity is given by which it can be established whether or not the individual has 'sufficient understanding and intelligence' to know what the research involves.
- Young people are normally presumed to be competent to give consent on attaining the age of 18. Exceptionally a child may be deemed competent, according to Gillick,³² in which case "Parental right yields to the child's right to make his own decisions when he reaches a sufficient understanding and intelligence to be capable of making up his own mind on the matter requiring decision."³³
- Young people are often invited to participate in research as members of cohorts, particularly in educational research. In such cases, persons in authority in schools, colleges and other educational institutions, sports, youth work or other community settings may act as gatekeepers. The informed consent of the child and their legal carer must be ascertained by the gatekeeper.
- When consent for research is through a gatekeeper, the interests of the gatekeeper should also be taken into consideration.

³² See *Gillick v West Norfolk & Wisbech Area Health Authority* [1985] UKHL 7 (17 October 1985) from the British and Irish Legal Information Institute (BAILII) website

³³ http://www.nspcc.org.uk/inform/research/questions/gillick_wda61289.html#Further_reading

- For research with individual children or young people, written consent should be obtained, but if the participant cannot sign, a mark on the document is acceptable.

Risk, Harm and Distress

- Historically children have been excluded from research that may have benefited them or other children because of a desire to protect them from harm and risk. There is a balance, however, to be struck between the risk of harm and the potential benefits to children through participation in research
- The response to risk of a child or a young person may be unpredictable and a procedure or research process that, 'bothers one child may not bother another'. All concerned in the process of the research need to identify what they understand as 'risks' that are involved for the child or young person because of their participation in the research project.
- Expectations must be carefully managed during the research process. The limitations of the research should be explained at the outset so that children or young people do not have hopes raised that issues or problems discussed in an interview will be resolved. The limitations of the researcher role must be clearly explained.
- Details of support services should be known to the researcher and available and accessible for the participant. Support during the research from a friend may assist the child or young person if sensitive issues are raised. The facility to debrief after participation should be made available where necessary.
- Research with young people may also pose a risk of harm or distress to the researcher, or other workers with access to the data. This is a particular risk in qualitative research where data may have an emotional content through the disclosure of distressing aspects of children's lives. Such risk should be anticipated and structures to support those affected by such processes as the coding of interviews should be available.
- Researchers who work directly with children or young people must undergo security screening. In the case of foreign nationals undertaking research, the equivalent clearance must be obtained from the relevant government or agency, and the additional time in obtaining such clearance needs to be taken account of in planning the research.
- As a potentially vulnerable and relatively powerless group in society children are often not in a position to challenge potential misrepresentations of themselves in research. This should be taken into consideration when developing mechanisms for the involvement of children and young people in research, particularly in terms of a dissemination strategy.

Benefit

- The research may not benefit the participant directly but have a recognized benefit for other children and young people in the future.
- The following are some questions that may help guide the researcher in the assessment of harm and distress:
 - How significant, severe or how common is the phenomenon that the research aims to address?
 - How is the knowledge gained likely to be used?
 - Will the research benefit the child participant or other children?
 - Will the potential benefit be limited because of expense or difficult access?

- Is there a less intrusive research method that could be used?
- Are the benefits immediate, brief, long lasting or not evident until years later?
- Should a wider range of children be offered the potential benefit of participating in the research?

Privacy and Confidentiality

- A consideration of best interests may mean that the child or young person may be encouraged by the researcher to include their parent or guardian. However, if competent children do not want to involve their parent / guardian this should be respected.
- Any decision to disclose confidential information to a third party must be explained to the competent child before disclosure.
- Research data given in confidence may be liable to a court subpoena and research participants should be informed of this fact in relevant circumstances.
- Researchers have responsibilities within the context of safeguarding children if they have reasonable cause for concern that a child is suffering harm. In this case, the researcher has a responsibility to liaise urgently with social services or the clinical carers of the child or young person. Relaying sensitive information should be discussed with the child by the researcher prior to disclosure.

Dignity

- Dignity should be preserved for all involved in research. Therefore, the researcher needs to minimize any inconvenience, intrusion, embarrassment, coercion or distress within the design of the protocol.
- Researchers should be sensitive to cultural issues, concerns and values that the child or young person may hold. For example, the acknowledgement of religious fasts should be taken into consideration.
- Where the child displays special needs, information should be provided in an appropriate format and the skills of a specialist colleague may be required as a facilitator or as an advocate.
- Disparity between the power and status of the researcher and the participant child(ren) or young person(s) should be addressed within the research design.
- Researchers should acknowledge the participants and dignify their involvement by routinely providing feedback about the research.